



**HIGHWAYS AND TRANSPORT
SCRUTINY COMMITTEE
12 MARCH 2018**

PRESENT: COUNCILLOR M BROOKES (CHAIRMAN)

Councillors C J T H Brewis (Vice-Chairman), Mrs J Brockway, M A Griggs, R Grocock, Mrs W Bowkett, S P Roe, A N Stokes, E W Strengiel, B Adams and R A Renshaw.

Councillors: Clio Perraton-Williams attended the meeting as an observer.

Officers in attendance:-

Katrina Cope (Senior Democratic Services Officer), Ian Kitchen (Transport Manager - Policy and Orders), Mick Phoenix (Regulation Services Manager), Paul Rusted (Infrastructure Commissioner), Satish Shah (Network Manager South) and Daniel Steel (Scrutiny Officer).

55 APOLOGIES OF ABSENCE/REPLACEMENT MEMBERS

No apologies for absence were received.

56 DECLARATION OF MEMBERS' INTEREST

Councillor S P Roe wished it to be noted that the North Hykeham Relief Road would be crossing his families land.

57 MINUTES OF THE MEETING HELD ON 22 JANUARY 2018

RESOLVED

That the minutes of the Highways and Transport Scrutiny Committee held on 22 January 2018, be agreed and signed by the Chairman as a correct record.

**58 ANNOUNCEMENTS BY THE CHAIRMAN, EXECUTIVE COUNCILLOR
AND LEAD OFFICERS**

The Chairman advised the Committee that no decision had been made with regard to topic's for a Scrutiny Review, as the last Overview and Scrutiny Management Board had been cancelled due to the bad weather. The Committee noted that scrutiny review items would be put forward for consideration to the next meeting of the Overview and Scrutiny Management Board due to be held on 29 March 2018.

59 HIGHWAYS 2020 UPDATE

The Committee gave consideration to a report from Paul Rusted, Infrastructure Commissioner, which provided an update on the work being carried out to replace the Lincolnshire Highways Alliance.

In guiding the Committee through the report, reference was made to:-

- The background behind the three contracts relationships, which for the Alliance were due to reach their full term on the 31 March 2020;
- The work that had been undertaken to date, which had included market engagement, local authority visits;
- The Options Appraisal process – Reference was made to the Highways Maintenance Efficiency Programme Toolkit, Councillor Option Workshop (details of the five preferred main options were detailed on page 2 of the report presented);
- Working Group Option Workshop; and Preferred Option Selection. The Committee was advised that the Executive at their meeting held on the 5 December 2017 had accepted Option 17, which provided for a single provider contractor with improved reactive service incentivisation for the Highway Works Term Contract;
- Working Groups – The Committee was advised that a number of working groups had been set up to move forward the detailed work required to progress the preferred option. This included:-

Contract Drafting – It was reported that the documentation was nearly complete;

Depot Strategy - The Committee was advised that all depots had been surveyed to fully understand their current usage. The Committee was further advised that Lincolnshire Legal had been appointed to draft a formal Lease Agreement; and that meetings had been held to consider the options available to Lincolnshire County Council (LCC); and the potential changes moving forward;

Pricing Documents – It was reported that Highways Maintenance Efficiency Programme Pricing Document was to be adopted throughout the contract for the majority of items;

Reactive Service Incentivisation – It was noted that meetings had been held to discuss the options available with the relevant staff;

Performance – It was reported that a review was being undertaken of performance measures being adopted by other authorities; and that contractual drafting had commenced;

Specification – It was highlighted that a Lincolnshire specification would be adopted in one document, which was a move away from the current position. It was highlighted further that the reason for this was because Highways England would not be supporting the national specification document for Local Authorities in the future and it was believed that collating all the information in one document would be clearer for officer use. The Committee noted that Lincolnshire Laboratory had completed

the initial draft which was currently in the process of being issued to the LCC specialists; and

Procurement – It was noted that a single procurement exercise would commence using the Competitive Procedure with Negotiation with three individuals Lots for each of the contracts (Works, Professional Services and Traffic Signals). It was noted further that LCC was likely to restrict the bidders to only being successful in one Lot.

- Work Planned – Details of work planned for the next period was shown on page 4 of the report presented. Particular reference was made to further market engagement and that an Industry Day had been provisionally arranged for 18 May 2018; this would give potential bidders the opportunity to find out more about Lincolnshire.

In conclusion, the Committee was advised that the project was on target having completed its option appraisal phase; and that the next phase of work would continue to develop the detailed contract documentation required to deliver the preferred option.

During discussion, the Committee raised the following issues:-

- One member felt that there needed to be flexibility in the contract for dialogue with contractors. Officers confirmed that there would be flexibility to allow work to be done in the most appropriate way, and that officers had no problems at all speaking to contractors. It was agreed that any member with a concern regarding a contract should speak to the officers involved, or raise the matter with the Executive Councillor;
- A suggestion was made that going forward the newly appointed contractors should be invited to attend Scrutiny Committee meetings at agreed times; and
- One member welcomed the unannounced inspection of contract works.

RESOLVED

That the Highways 2020 Update report be received.

60 QUARTER 3 PERFORMANCE REPORT (1 OCTOBER TO 31 DECEMBER 2017)

Consideration was given to a report from Paul Rusted, Infrastructure Commissioner, which set out the performance of the highways service which included:-

- Lincolnshire Highways Alliance;
- Major Highway Schemes Update;
- National Road Condition Indicators,
- Customer, Quality Cost (CQC) Efficiency Network Results 2017; and
- Customer Satisfaction Information.

Attached to the report were the following Appendices:-

HIGHWAYS AND TRANSPORT SCRUTINY COMMITTEE

12 MARCH 2018

- Appendix A – Lincolnshire Highways Alliance Performance Report Year 8 Quarter 3 October to December 2017;
- Appendix B – Major Highway Scheme Update Report March 2018;
- Appendix C – National Road Condition Indicators 2017/18;
- Appendix D – CQC Efficiency Network Results 2017; and
- Appendix E – Customer Satisfaction Information Quarter 3 October to December 2017.

In guiding the Committee through the report, the Infrastructure Commissioner advised that the Council had submitted its Department for Transport Self-Assessment for the 2018/19 funding round. The Committee was advised that the Council had assessed itself as being Level 3 for all 22 areas of competence, which would retain the Band 3 status; and help the Council retain all of the Incentive Element of funding. It was reported that for 2017/18 this funding had been £2.652m.

Appendix B to the report provided the Committee with information relating to Major Highway Schemes. The Committee received an update pertaining to the Lincoln Eastern Bypass. Confirmation was given that LCC had terminated its contract with Carillon on 22 January 2018; and that the Council had awarded a contract to Galliford Try as the replacement contractor through the Midland Highway Alliance Medium Schemes Framework on 1 February 2018, with a start date of 5 February 2018. It was reported that the majority of existing Carillon site staff remained on site had been transferred to Galliford Try. It was noted that an initial package of works had been agreed with Galliford Try, which would include the completion of the Market Rasen Rail Line Bridge, providing temporary crossings to the River Witham Viaduct and Delph crossings.

The Committee was advised that BAM Nuttall had nearly completed the bridge on the Spalding line near the Washingborough Road. It was also highlighted that work by Network Archaeology was currently planned until the end of March; and that this was now emerging as a significant risk to the scheme budget with projected costs of £8.2m.

Appendix A to the report provided the Committee with performance information relating to the Lincolnshire Highway Alliance for Quarter 3 which covered the period for October to December 2017. Page 6 of the report advised that the Alliance partners had managed to achieve their targets for Quarter 3. The Infrastructure Commissioner advised that some of the result figures on the bottom of page 6 were incorrect; and advised the Committee of the following amendments:-

- Alliance Key Performance Indicators (LCC/Kier/WSP/Dynniq) should be 62%; and
- Highways Works Term Contract Performance Indicators (Kier) should be 87.6%.

It was reported that the main focus of work of the Highways Term Contract was to improve the carriageway condition. It was highlighted that in Quarter 3, 18719 potholes had been repaired. It was highlighted further that around 334 miles of

surface dressing was due to be carried out in the summer, to extend the life of existing roads and prevent potholes from forming.

Reference was also made to the National Road Condition Indicators 2017/18; details relating to the history of road condition indicators for Lincolnshire's network were detailed in Appendix C.

The Committee was advised that the CQC Efficiency Network Results analysis for this year had suggested that the Council was operating at a 98% efficiency level. It was noted that this was supported and reflected in some of the other associated data which suggested that the service was being delivered in an efficient and effective way. Information pertaining to the CQC Efficiency Results 2017 was contained in Appendix D to the report.

It was reported that customer complaints relating to highways had decreased by around 20% in Quarter 3, as had compliments. Full information relating to complaints and complements was detailed in Appendix E to the report.

During discussion, the Committee raised the following issues:-

- Some concern was expressed at the Archaeological costs. Officers confirmed that as works progressed, there should be less artefacts to find;
- Some members of the Committee welcomed the report and the progress made;
- One member enquired as to how much money had been lost as a result of Carillion going into liquidation, and as a result, whether there had been any action taken to safeguard the Council in the future. The Committee was advised that no money had been lost as the contract had been paid in arrears; and that the Council had been able to deduct costs from the final payment. With regard to safeguarding, the Committee was advised that no assurance could be given, but due diligence would be maintained to protect the Council;
- Some members advised that they had found the graphics in the report very informative; and
- PSP 15 – Predictability of Work Costs – One member enquired why this was unable to be measured. The Committee was advised that at the moment it was difficult to get cost data out of the system.

RESOLVED

That the Performance Report for Quarter 3 (October 2017 – December 2017) be received.

61 EFFECTIVE HIGHWAYS COMMUNICATION

The Committee received a report from Satish Shah, Highway Network Manager, which provided an update on the measures being undertaken to improve the highways and transport service users' experience.

**HIGHWAYS AND TRANSPORT SCRUTINY COMMITTEE
12 MARCH 2018**

The Committee was advised that the new Communications Strategy would look to improve existing communication channels through the various media options; as well as reviewing information available on the website, including the use of infographics to help to get the message out as to the work carried out by highways.

It was reported that there were still some issues with the Highway Fault reporting Online System LAGAN. The Committee was advised that it was hoped to launch an improved version of the system later in the year.

The report provided information as to how engagement with County Councillors was progressing. It was noted that the next Member Session was due to be held in May 2018. Following feedback received from the November sessions, it was proposed to hold just one session, instead of one in each of the four areas. The report suggested that the one session could be held in the Council Chamber following the Council meeting as most Councillors would already be present. The Committee was invited to give their views on future engagement with Councillors.

The Committee was advised that Local Highway Managers had held a total of 16 Parish Cluster meetings last year to give an overview of how the highways service operated based on the Future Operating Model. Details relating to the issues discussed were shown within the report presented.

Paragraph 5.2 of the report provided suggestions with regard to future engagement with Town and Parish Councils.

In conclusion, it was recognised that progress had been made to improve the customer experience, but there was still more that could be done, especially with regard to electronic access to latest information and regular updates on fault reports.

A short discussion ensued, from which the following issues were raised:-

- Disappointment was expressed to the fact that the LAGAN system update had been put back;
- Some members expressed their personal experiences of reporting faults. The Committee was advised that there had been connectivity issues; and a problem had also occurred when new users had registered;
- Members expressed their support for having one Councillor engagement event;
- Some members felt that the provision of web pages/emails for communicating with parish and town councils was the way forward. The Committee also agreed that Councillors also had a role in ensuring that Town and Parish Councils were kept up to date; and
- One member enquired as to whether a response to a complaint could be sent to more than one person. Officers agreed to look into this matter.

RESOLVED

- 1 That the experience of Committee Members to report faults; and reporting back progress be referred to the Channel Shift Project Board.

- 2 That the Committee agreed to the suggestion of one Member Session being held after the full Council meeting in May 2018; and support was given to the provision of web pages as a way of communicating and engaging with Town and Parish Councils. Support was also extended to retaining six monthly engagement sessions with Town and Parish Councils.
- 3 That an update relating to Effective Highways Communication be received by the Committee at the 22 October 2018 meeting.

62 DFT 'PROPOSALS FOR THE CREATION OF A MAJOR ROAD NETWORK' CONSULTATION

Consideration was given to a report from Ian Kitchen, Transport Policy Manager, which outlined the Department for Transport (DfT's) proposal to create a Major Road Network (MRN) comprising of the most economically important local authority 'A' Roads to complement the national motorway and strategic trunk roads.

Attached to the report were the following Appendices:-

- Appendix A - National DfT Indicative Major Network;
- Appendix B - DfT Indicative Major Road Network for Lincolnshire;
- Appendix C – Proposed Midlands Connect Major Road Network; and
- Appednix D - Proposed Lincolnshire Major Road Network.

The Committee was advised that as part of the Government's Transport Investment Strategy published in July 2017, commitment was given to creating a MRN across England. The MRN would comprise of economically important local authority 'A' roads and complement Highways England's Strategic Road Network. It was highlighted that initial work on identifying a Major Road Network had been carried out through the Rees Jeffreys Road Fund, which had been published in late 2016.

A full explanation of how the Department for Transport was proposing to define the networks was detailed on page 20 of the report. Appendix A to the report provided details of the National DfT Indicative Major Road Network; and Appendix B detailed the DfT Indicative Major Road Network for Lincolnshire. The roads put forward by the DfT were the A15 north of Lincoln, A16, A17, A57 and A46 (between A57 and A15).

Appendix C to the report provided the latest proposal across the Midlands Connect area; and Appendix D provided more detail on the proposal for Lincolnshire. The Lincolnshire roads put forward for inclusion over those proposed by the DfT were:-

- A158 Lincoln to Skegness;
- A52 Boston to Grantham; and
- A15 Sleaford to Peterborough.

The Committee was advised that it was proposed that Lincolnshire's response reflected the above proposals.

The Committee was advised that the DfT was seeking to ensure that the MRN supported long-term strategic needs to make best use of the targeted funding being made available from the National Roads Fund. For this to happen, there were proposals for a strong regional focus for investment planning within a consistent national network. It was reported that to achieve this DfT was suggesting that Sub-National Transport Bodies (STBs) were best place to carry out this role. It was highlighted that where STBs were yet to be formed, proposals were that Local Authorities (LAs) and Local Enterprise Partnerships (LEPs) should form agreed regional groups to manage the work. Page 21 of the report outlined what the key steps in this process would be; and page 22 highlighted which schemes would be eligible and what the overarching objectives of the Government were for the funding.

It was reported that the closing date for responses to the DfTs consultation was Monday 19 March 2018; following which a formal DfT consultation response would be published during the summer of 2018.

The Committee was invited to comment on the DfTs proposals for the creation of a Major Road Network.

During a short discussion, the Committee raised the following points:-

- One member felt that the A1121 from Swineshead to Boston and the Birchwood to Skellingthorpe (A158) should have been included. The Committee was advised that the A1121 was considered; but it was felt that the A52 was the better choice due to the importance of the route to the key agri-food industries in the south of the county;
- Most members welcomed the investment, and the proposals as detailed in Appendix D to the report.

RESOLVED

That the Committee supported the proposals as detailed in Appendix D to the report.

63 NETWORK RAIL EAST COAST MAIN LINE ROUTE STUDY CONSULTATION

The Committee gave consideration to a report from Ian Kitchen, Transport Policy Manager, which advised of the recent developments concerning the current East Coast rail service franchise.

It was reported that the East Coast Main Line (ECML) Study was now available for consultation. It was highlighted that the County Council and LEP had been fully engaged in the process. Paragraph 1.11 of the report highlighted the proposed consultation response.

The Committee was advised that in relation to the East Coast Rails Franchise, there was a need to ensure that current service commitments in the existing ECML

franchise were met in full, in particular the new Lincoln to London direct services due to commence in 2019. It was highlighted that arrangements at this time still remained unclear with the announcement of Virgin East Coast Trains franchise ceasing earlier, this was reported as being a date to be agreed by the Secretary of State.

During discussion, the following issues were raised:-

- Newark Flat Crossing - There was a consensus that the crossing desperately needed updating. The Committee was advised that there was a huge cost of solving the Newark flat crossing, and that electrification of the Joint Line might be a more economically viable alternative option. Officers agreed to append to the consultation a report completed by Councillor C J T H Brewis relating to 'Electrification of the 'Joint Line';
- The need to upgrade Lincoln Station; and
- The need to ensure that before any developments, there was an understanding of the local surrounding area i.e. effect on wildlife and the local community. The Committee was advised that this did not form part of the consultation, but officers would raise the matter at their next meeting.

RESOLVED

1. That the Committee supported the proposed response of the Council to the Network Rail East Coast Main Line Route Study Consultation.
2. That the position in respect of the existing East Coast rail franchise be noted.

64 PERMIT SCHEME ANNUAL REPORT

The Committee gave consideration to a joint report from Mick Phoenix, Network Management Commissioner and Mandi Robinson, Network Regulation Compliance Manager, which provided an overview of the Council's operational performance in its first year and provided detailed scrutiny of the available data in relation to street works and activities in Lincolnshire.

Detailed at Appendix A to the report was the Lincolnshire County Council Permit Scheme – Scheme Evaluation Report 2016/17 First Year. The Committee was advised that the report highlighted that through the use of conditions to manage activities on the highway, in cooperation with Utility Companies and other Works Promoters, measurable improvements had been made to the Lincolnshire network.

Table 1 on Page 43 provided details of the total number of Permit and Permit Variation applications received. The Committee was advised that 40,849 total permit and permit variation applications had been received by Lincolnshire County Council in the first year of the scheme; and of these 34,029 had been granted; and 5,333 had been refused. It was noted that from previous year's comparison data, the scheme had showed that there had been a saving of 2,436 days of occupancy by utilities working on the highway, which equated to £4,384,800 savings to the Lincolnshire economy.

The Committee was advised that the first year had seen a deficit of £13,391 due to initial set up costs. It was noted that for future years the scheme would pay for itself.

The Committee was advised that only 10% of the works inspected failed to meet the required standards. Particular reference was made to Virgin Media.

One member enquired how the cost of a permit was calculated. The Committee was advised that it was more difficult in Lincolnshire due to its rural nature, it was noted there was national matrix. Officers advised that the charges Lincolnshire applied were mid-range compared to others.

The Committee welcomed the report.

RESOLVED

That the report Lincolnshire County Council Permit Scheme – Scheme Evaluation Report 2016/2017 First Year be received.

65 HIGHWAYS AND TRANSPORT SCRUTINY COMMITTEE WORK PROGRAMME

Consideration was given to a report from the Daniel Steel, Scrutiny Officer, which enabled the Committee to consider and comment on the content of its work programme for the coming year to ensure that scrutiny activity was focused where it could be of greatest benefit.

Appendix A to the report provided the Committee with details of its proposed work programme up to December 2018.

RESOLVED

That the Work Programme as detailed at Appendix A be received; subject to the addition of an Options Paper concerning Additional Funding for Highways Maintenance being added to the work programme for 23 April 2018 meeting; and Effective Highways Communication being added to the work programme for the 22 October 2018 meeting.

The meeting closed at 12.35 pm